

Rubric Sample Performance Indicator Language

1. **Personalized Elements:** Include criteria that assess the inclusion of personal insights, experiences, or reflections. Since AI models can't provide personal experiences, this can mitigate against their use.
 - **Emerging:** The essay has minimal personal insights or experiences, not providing support evidence.
 - **Developing:** The essay includes some personal insights or experiences, but they are not well integrated into the argument, or have limited supporting evidence.
 - **Basic Proficiency:** The essay includes clear personal insights or experiences integrated into the argument with substantial supporting evidence.
 - **Extending:** The essay includes comprehensive, insightful, and meaningful personal experiences that enhance the argument and demonstrate deep understanding.
2. **Critical Thinking:** Include criteria that assess critical thinking, such as the ability to analyze, synthesize, and evaluate information (higher order). AI models can generate content, but they don't really "think" or process information in the way humans do.
 - **Emerging:** The essay shows minimal evidence of critical thinking.
 - **Developing:** The essay shows some evidence of critical thinking, but the analysis or evaluation could be deeper.
 - **Basic Proficiency:** The essay shows clear evidence of critical thinking, with good analysis and evaluation.
 - **Extending:** The essay shows strong evidence of critical thinking, with deep, insightful analysis and evaluation.
3. **Creativity:** Include criteria that assess creativity, such as the ability to generate unique ideas or solutions. While AI models can generate novel combinations of existing ideas, they don't truly create in the way humans do.
 - **Emerging:** The essay lacks original ideas or solutions.
 - **Developing:** The essay includes some original ideas or solutions, but they are not well developed or integrated into the argument.
 - **Basic Proficiency:** The essay includes clear original ideas or solutions that support the argument.
 - **Extending:** The essay includes highly original and well-developed ideas or solutions that further enhance the argument.
4. **Consistency in Writing Style:** Include criteria that assess the consistency in writing style throughout the essay. AI-generated text is more likely to have inconsistencies in style or tone.
 - **Emerging:** The essay shows significant inconsistencies in style or tone.
 - **Developing:** The essay shows some inconsistencies in style or tone.
 - **Basic Proficiency:** The essay is mostly consistent in style and tone.
 - **Extending:** The essay is highly consistent in style and tone, contributing to a cohesive and compelling argument.

5. **Depth of Understanding:** Include criteria that assess the depth of understanding of the course concepts. AI models can provide information on a topic, but it is often more superficial.
- **Emerging:** The essay shows minimal understanding of the course concepts.
 - **Developing:** The essay shows basic understanding of the course concepts.
 - **Basic Proficiency:** The essay shows clear understanding of the course concepts.
 - **Extending:** The essay shows deep and insightful understanding of the course concepts.
6. **Class Discussion References:** Include criteria that assess references to class discussions or specific lectures. This helps ensure the student is engaging with the course material and AI models of course wouldn't be present in class.
- **Emerging:** The essay contains minimal references to class discussions or specific lectures.
 - **Developing:** The essay includes some references to class discussions or specific lectures, but they are not well integrated into the argument.
 - **Basic Proficiency:** The essay includes clear references to class discussions or specific lectures that support the argument.
 - **Extending:** The essay includes insightful references to class discussions or specific lectures that enhance the argument and demonstrate deep engagement with the course material.
7. **Progress Over Time:** If possible, include criteria that assess progress over time. This could involve comparing the current assignment with past assignments to check for drastic changes in writing style or quality that might indicate the use of an AI model.
- **Emerging:** The essay shows minimal progress compared to past assignments.
 - **Developing:** The essay shows some progress compared to past assignments.
 - **Basic Proficiency:** The essay shows clear progress compared to past assignments.
 - **Extending:** The essay shows significant progress compared to past assignments, demonstrating ongoing learning and improvement.